

CEO Appraisal Results 2016

Questionnaires were distributed via electronic survey to the 23 following cohorts:

- 13 Elected Members
- 4 General Managers
- 5 staff chosen at random and in confidence
- The Chief Executive Officer

Respondents were asked to provide a rating against 6 questions using the following scoring system:

6	Excellent
5	Very good
4	Good
3	Satisfactory
2	Minor concerns
1	Serious concerns (unsatisfactory)
0	Unable to assess

The numbers in each column 0 to 6 show the number of responses with that score for each cohort. The row titled 'Average' is the average of the responses for each cohort to two decimal places (excluding any zero scores as 'unable to assess'). The final column 'CEO' is the self-assessment rating by the Chief Executive Officer.

All but four questionnaires (from elected members) were completed and returned. These have been collated and summarised in this report. Individual responses have not been identified and, following consideration by Council, will be destroyed.

Comments from respondents are included under each of the key performance criteria.

1. Leadership and strategic planning: The CEO demonstrates leadership in setting Council’s strategic plans and effectively communicates and delivers Council’s vision and objectives.

Rating	EM	Staff	GM	CEO
0 Unable to assess	-	-	-	
2 Minor concerns	-	1	-	
3 Satisfactory	-	-	-	
4 Good	2	2	2	
5 Very good	3	1	1	1
6 Excellent	4	1	1	
Average	5.2	4.2	4.8	5.0

Comments

Justin, keeps abreast of best practice in Strategic Management and projects, and is opening up dialogue for the EM's and Staff to be able to have an understanding of his views and to be able to provide comment.

Justin is a very competent CEO, prepared to listen and then if appropriate.

Would like to hear his views more often. Appreciate Justin sharing his views for Strategic planning.

The last year has seen a marked change in leadership.....in a positive way.

He delivers the message well. This is against a background of some members believing they have all the answers.

Justin uses the strategic plan to bring sometimes challenging topics back to the overall plan. While he may have his views on a decision and is not afraid to put his views forward prior to a decision, once it has been made by EM's he will carry it out.

Always guiding the organisation strategically and on many fronts with clear direction. This is evident in the new Strategic Plan process and input soon to be presented. Has a communication style that enables understanding of the goals right down the line.

Justin is committed, balanced and not afraid to offer his opinion. He is effective in drawing Elected Members into the process.

Operational staff are aware of, and aligning work to, Council's strategic objectives, evidence of a well communicated strategic vision that is inclusive and clear. These messages are well reinforced in 'bite sized chunks' in the CEO newsletter.

I do believe more leadership should be shown in this area. I think it is made difficult for the CEO by Elected Members focussing on operational matters.

From my experience Justin is able to understand the importance of strategies which provide council with a clear direction allowing us to be proactive rather than reactive to certain situations.

2. **People management: The CEO demonstrates leadership in driving positive outcomes in relation to recruitment, retention, remuneration, training, performance appraisal, induction, professional development and industrial relations and actively promotes and develops a positive staff culture and safe working environment.**

Rating	EM	Staff	GM	CEO
0 Unable to assess	2	-	-	
1 Serious concerns	-	-	-	
2 Minor concerns	-	-	-	
3 Satisfactory	1	2	-	
4 Good	3	2	1	
5 Very good	3	1	2	1
6 Excellent	-	-	1	
Average	4.3	3.8	5.0	5.0

Comments

We have a renewed focus on People and Culture best practice and as evidenced by the recent sign off of the ASU EBA and as a result staff morale is at an all time high and business results will almost certainly reflect this.

As a Councillor he always shows good leadership, with I believe most Councillors listen to what he says, which on most occasions leads to a positive response.

Many staff are very committed to their work but there also seems to be an acceptance of less competent or slow responses to residents in some situations and this needs to be changed.

Promotes a good staff culture but I believe still has a blind faith in some Managers which I believe they do not deserve.

The team is working well. There appears to be good rapport with all staff. Has been very successful in the latest industrial rounds. He could perhaps be a bit more demanding of some in the leadership team.

The restructure this year following the departure of a GM was a good one and I was really pleased that he did not take a business as usual approach. It has paid off in terms of budget also.

Great improvements over the last year in terms of new staff, people and culture effectiveness, staff development and WHS accreditation. Staff morale and caring for community is very high and so delivering benefits.

Again, Justin leads the process effectively in these areas.

My chief concern however relates to the relationships between staff and Elected Members. While I acknowledge that it will always be a vexed one for some, it was apparent from a couple of instances in the past year, that staff appear to feel comfortable in criticising EMs in the presence of or to, the CEO. This is unfortunate and perhaps evidence that this element of the culture needs work.

From a staff member perspective, visible developments in this area in the past year have been numerous and show a high level of attention to our people. Some of these evident to operational staff include development of a leadership brand and associated professional development for senior managers, consultative creation of a safety brand, allocation of extra resources to WHS, development of PDR processes, significant improvements to support for staff recruitment and performance management, and development of an EA that reflects CHB remaining relevant in a changing market. Justin's 'real' recognition of staff at meetings and in CEO newsletters, and his approachability and genuine interest in staff and their work also contribute to a positive staff culture.

I would say that this is an area that is not a major focus of the CEO. I feel he is more concerned about getting runs on the board, and getting projects delivered, irrespective of how staff are treated along the way. The CEO seems more concerned with saving money than recognising, rewarding and retaining high achieving staff.

It is fantastic that Justin is a big supporter of improving PDR systems (cornerstone) and providing staff with many opportunities to develop their skills and knowledge.

However, in terms of culture it can at times be hard to feel valued and know your place/importance of your role within an organisation that continually moves teams from Manager to Manager through restructures. One team in particular is set to be moved to another manager in the near future, this equating to a total of 4 managers in 4 years.

3. Financial and asset management: The CEO ensures Council’s long term financial sustainability through sound financial and asset planning, budget management and financial reporting.

Rating	EM	Staff	GM	CEO
0 Unable to assess	1	1	-	
1 Serious concerns (unsatisfactory)	-	-	-	
2 Minor concerns	-	-	-	
3 Satisfactory	-	-	-	
4 Good	2	3	1	
5 Very good	6	1	3	1
6 Excellent	-	-	-	
Average	5.4	4.3	4.8	5.0

Comments

Justin insists through the SLT members that financial planning and budget management is the number 1 priority for all staff and there are regular reports on the status of these areas with logical commentary around any unforeseen events that occur from time to time.

This is not my area of expertise, but in my time on Council, rates to residents continues to get lower.

Needs to tighten up Mr Walker's work in this area.

Our financial position is good and he leads the council in the right direction.

The budget result for this year has been excellent. The timing of the FAG's payment presented it's challenges. EM's sought to provide a budget with a surplus which contained an amount for contingency over the budget, which was maintained through out the year.

Excellent year end results. Has managed all the financial ups & downs with a healthy surplus and low rate rise. Of course, always more to do on this front but on top of it. New Audit committee has added value.

Effectively drives GM City Assets and Corporate Services in setting goals and monitoring achievement.

Justin seems to do a good job over looking a very thorough budget process. It would be beneficial however for the CEO to have a better understanding in how investing in education and promotional budgets can have a long term benefit in reducing operational costs. Some promotional/educational lines contain less than 1% of the funds required for the operational service.

4. Operations management and major projects: The CEO oversees all of Council's operations to ensure delivery of effective, efficient and high quality services to the community and the delivery of major projects on time and within budget.

Rating	EM	Staff	GM	CEO
0 Unable to assess	-	-	-	
1 Serious concerns (unsatisfactory)	-	-	-	
2 Minor concerns	-	-	-	
3 Satisfactory	1	-	-	
4 Good	4	3	1	
5 Very good	4	2	3	1
6 Excellent	-	-	-	
Average	4.3	4.4	4.8	5.0

Comments

Justins mantra is always "On time and on Budget" and he has very low tolerances for non compliance in this area. However there are occasional time frames that are warped through circumstances beyond his control

I believe he shows a concentrated passion to achieve the best result for major projects.

Usually appears to be quite conversant in this area.

He has a good manager in Steve Hodge for delivery of asset projects. Service to the community has improved markedly with YMCA running the Holdfast Bay Community centre. HOpefully this will be extended.

Overall Good for operations management and community outcomes - Kauri Parade has been managed better in this FY but keeps the rating down in this area

All major projects monitored and on track. 6% of cap works carried over due to changes, timing, grants etc. Some challenging projects like ex-BTH, Minda, Kauri all progressing well - with appropriate governance/legal (which slows down the works).

Overall, well managed, however there have been instances where perhaps closer oversight, further questioning and challenging may have prevented significant overruns such as Kauri Parade and protracted disputes, as in the case of the Brighton Oval precinct.

The vibrant range of major projects and high level services that are being delivered, as listed on annual business plans and website is impressive and responsive to our community's needs. The mix of projects and services shows leadership and direction that has a balance of commercial and community outcomes.

I would say that sometimes there should be more focus on getting the job done properly rather than doing an average job, but getting it done on time. Better project planning would allow for more realistic expectations to be set.

5. **Stakeholder management and communication: The CEO develops and maintains positive and effective relationships and communications with Council's stakeholders including, but not limited to, ratepayers, Commonwealth and State Government agencies, other councils, the media, community organisations, businesses and industry bodies.**

Rating	EM	Staff	GM	CEO
0 Unable to assess	-	-	-	
1 Serious concerns (unsatisfactory)	-	-	-	
2 Minor concerns	-	-	-	
3 Satisfactory	-	1	-	
4 Good	1	2	-	
5 Very good	6	2	2	1
6 Excellent	2	-	2	
Average	5.1	4.2	5.5	5.0

Comments

Justin is foremost a people person and uses his skill and experience in this area to maximise and build on relationships across many sectors.

Diplomatic.

Great manner with everyone and reads people very well. He has developed great relationships with government on all levels. A good media operator.

Rating mainly was given in relation to EM & Government Agencies. In regards community organisations & ratepayers have not heard criticism.

Develops and maintains positive relationships. Sometimes this has its challenges eg not everyone gets all they want. Good strike rate on grants from good relationships. Media relations have improved overall. Constructive business relationships and promotion of Council's reputation.

Presents a professional face for COHB and appears to negotiate the competing interests effectively.

With the increasing level of control the State is taking away from local government, more focus needs to be given on the advocacy role of Senior Leadership, particularly the CEO.

6. **Advice to and relationship with Council: The CEO develops and maintains positive and productive relationships with all elected members and provides them with sound advice, professional development, effective communications and support in order for them to meet their responsibilities.**

Rating	EM	Staff	GM	CEO
0 Unable to assess	-	1	-	
1 1 Serious concerns (unsatisfactory)	-	-	-	
2 Minor concerns	-	-	-	
3 Satisfactory	2	1	-	
4 Good	1	2	1	
5 Very good	3	1	3	1
6 Excellent	3	-	-	
Average	4.8	4.0	4.8	5.0

Comments

Working with a board of 13 people is always going to throw up challenges but Justin is always open to robust discussion and debate, and offers the opportunity for members to workshop any topic they may wish to explore .

This is his major attribute, which is assisted by a Mayor, who communicates regularly with him, ensuring a very well run Council.

Some issues have been apparent in the last year. Some caution necessary when approaching councillors about what they have or have not done. Be sure of facts. Listen carefully to other's points of view. Here say from staff members accepted as fact! Justin has a good team of councillors with many skills. This needs to be respected. Others are allowed to have different views.

Very good with some members who see themselves as the CEO. Provides good support to everyone as councillors. I have been very pleased with the support he has given me.

Whether by phone, email or in person Justin makes himself available - maybe emails on the weekend too much for his ability to maintain freshness. The answer coming back may not always be agreed with by EM's but the opportunity to communicate is the key factor here and it has been of a high standard.

I feel relationships have definitely improved during the year. A few bumpy moments there, but there always will be some. It's never personal, it's just passionate people with different perspectives. Advice in reports has improved but recognise there is still scope for improvement.

Justin has a difficult role in balancing the interests of Administration with 13 disparate people who have influence over Council's direction. In doing so, Justin can sometimes seem to be sitting on the fence and/or accused of offering EMs platitudes, without any real resolve. In balancing his role between Admin and EMs Justin also needs to walk a diplomatic line which ensures respect is shown by EMs to staff and vice versa.

I have little experience in observing how Justin maintains relationships however I have always been impressed with his ability to be articulate and knowledgeable on the varied services councils provide and any current issues council face. Justin has a warm trusting manner that seems to help with his ability to build and maintain relationships.